

COVID-19

Rx Meta-analysis Let the Data Speak

Paul E Marik, MD, FCCM, FCCP



Remdesivir: In-hospital RCTs

Mortality

		Statist	ics for e	ach study	<u>_</u>	Dead /	Total			Odds ra	Odds ratio and	Odds ratio and 95% C	Odds ratio and 95% Cl	Odds ratio and 95% Cl
	Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-Remdesivir	Group-Control							
Wang	1.116	0.501	2.488	0.269	0.788	22 / 158	10 / 79				-+-		Ⅰ	
Beigel	0.724	0.507	1.035	-1.773	0.076	62 / 541	79 / 521				│ ├╼┤	│ ├╼┤ │	│ ├──┤ │ │	│ ├──┤ │ │
Spinner	0.249	0.045	1.370	-1.599	0.110	2 / 396	4 / 200	K		_ 	_ <u>_</u>		_ 	_
SOLIDARITY	0.978	0.826	1.159	-0.254	0.800	301 / 2743	303 / 2708							
	0.922	0.794	1.071	-1.057	0.290									
								0.1	0.2	0.2 0.5	0.2 0.5 1	0.2 0.5 1 2	0.2 0.5 1 2 5	0.2 0.5 1 2 5 1

Favours Remdesivir Favours Control

Tocilizumab: In-hospital RCTs

Mortality

Study name		Statisti	cs for e	ach study	<u>/</u>	Deat	hs / Total		c	dds ra	tio and	1 95%	СІ	
	Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-TCZ	Group-Control							
Hermine	0.906	0.308	2.661	-0.180	0.857	7 / 64	8 / 67				-	+		
Rosas	0.755	0.451	1.262	-1.072	0.284	58 / 294	28 / 114							
Salvarani	2.241	0.198	25.369	0.652	0.514	2 / 60	1 / 66				_	_ 		
Stone	1.155	0.345	3.868	0.233	0.816	9 / 161	4 / 82				╶┼═╴		-	
	0.847	0.553	1.297	-0.764	0.445									
								0.1	0.2	0.5	1	2	5	10
									Favou	rs TCZ	Fa	avour	s Contr	ol

Convalescent Plasma: In-hospital RCTs

Mortality



Corticosteroids: In-hospital RCTs

Mortality

oup by	Study name		Statist	ics for e	ach study	<u> </u>	Deat	n / Total
Steroid		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-Steroid	Group-Control
Dexa	CoDEX	0.800	0.488	1.313	-0.882	0.378	69 / 128	76 / 128
Dexa	RECOVERY	0.586	0.442	0.779	-3.690	0.000	95 / 324	283 / 683
Dexa		0.633	0.495	0.810	-3.641	0.000		
HC	CAPE COVID	0.455	0.200	1.035	-1.878	0.060	11 / 75	20 / 73
HC	REMAP-CAP	0.715	0.383	1.335	-1.053	0.292	26 / 105	29 / 92
HC		0.606	0.369	0.996	-1.975	0.048		
MP	Edalatifard	0.115	0.023	0.563	-2.667	0.008	2/34	12 / 34
MP		0.115	0.023	0.563	-2.667	0.008		
Overall		0.608	0.489	0.756	-4.466	0.000		

Favours Steroid Favours Control

Corticosteroids: In-hospital RCTs & Obs

Mortality

Group by	Study name		Statisti	cs for e	ach study	<u> </u>	Death	n / Total
RC1-Obs		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-Steroid	d Group-Control
Obs	Salton	0.256	0.098	0.671	-2.771	0.006	6 / 83	21 / 90
Obs	Fadel	0.451	0.223	0.911	-2.220	0.026	18 / 132	21 / 81
Obs	Fernandez-Cru	ız 0.514	0.274	0.965	-2.071	0.038	55 / 396	16 / 67
Obs		0.429	0.282	0.654	-3.931	0.000		
RCT	CoDEX	0.800	0.488	1.313	-0.882	0.378	69 / 128	76 / 128
RCT	RECOVERY	0.586	0.442	0.779	-3.690	0.000	95 / 324	283 / 683
RCT	CAPE COVID	0.455	0.200	1.035	-1.878	0.060	11 / 75	20 / 73
RCT	REMAP-CAP	0.715	0.383	1.335	-1.053	0.292	26 / 105	29 / 92
RCT	Edalatifard	0.115	0.023	0.563	-2.667	0.008	2/34	12 / 34
RCT		0.608	0.489	0.756	-4.466	0.000		
Overall		0.565	0.465	0.686	-5.773	0.000		

Favours Steroid Favours Control

Corticosteroids: In-hospital RCTs & Obs

Mortality

Group by	Study name		Statist	cs for e	ach study	<u> </u>	Deat	h / Total
CT-Obs		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-Steroi	d Group-Control
Obs	Salton	0.256	0.098	0.671	-2.771	0.006	6 / 83	21 / 90
Obs	Fadel	0.451	0.223	0.911	-2.220	0.026	18 / 132	21 / 81
Obs	Fernandez-Cru	uz 0.514	0.274	0.965	-2.071	0.038	55 / 396	16 / 67
Obs		0.429	0.282	0.654	-3.931	0.000		
RCT	CoDEX	0.800	0.488	1.313	-0.882	0.378	69 / 128	76 / 128
RCT	RECOVERY	0.586	0.442	0.779	-3.690	0.000	95 / 324	283 / 683
RCT	CAPE COVID	0.455	0.200	1.035	-1.878	0.060	11 / 75	20 / 73
RCT	REMAP-CAP	0.715	0.383	1.335	-1.053	0.292	26 / 105	29 / 92
RCT	Edalatifard	0.115	0.023	0.563	-2.667	0.008	2/34	12 / 34
RCT		0.608	0.489	0.756	-4.466	0.000		
Overall		0.565	0.465	0.686	-5.773	0.000		

Favours Steroid Favours Control

Hydroxychloroquine: In-hospital RCTs

Mortality

		Statisti	ics for e	ach study	Y	Death	ns / Total		ç	odds rat	io anc	I 95% (
	Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-HCQ	Group-Control							
RECOVERY	1.106	0.963	1.269	1.428	0.153	421 / 1561	790 / 3155							
SOLIDARITY	1.207	0.892	1.635	1.218	0.223	104 / 947	84 / 906				┼┳╌	-		
Self	0.977	0.544	1.755	-0.078	0.938	25 / 242	25 / 237				-	-		
Abd-Elsalan	1.213	0.358	4.116	0.310	0.757	6 / 97	5 / 97				╌┼╺╴	-	-	
	1.116	0.988	1.261	1.769	0.077						¢			
								0.1	0.2	0.5	1	2	5	10
									Favou	rs HCQ	Fa	avours	Contr	ol

Hydroxychloroquine: Outpatient RCT's

Hospitalization



Hydroxychloroquine: Prophylaxis

PCR Confirmed Infections

Froup by	-		Statist	ics for e	ach study	<u>_</u>	PCR infe	ction / Total		Od	ds ratio ar
Туре		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-HCQ	Group-Control			
Post-exposure	Boulware	0.808	0.537	1.214	-1.026	0.305	49 / 414	58 / 407			-=-
Post-exposure	Mitja	0.922	0.653	1.302	-0.459	0.646	64 / 1116	74 / 1196			-#-
Post-exposure	Barnabas	1.142	0.744	1.754	0.609	0.543	53 / 353	45 / 336			-
Post-exposure		0.940	0.751	1.176	-0.545	0.586					•
Pre-exposure	Abella	0.950	0.227	3.980	-0.070	0.944	4 / 64	4 / 61			e
Pre-exposure	Rajasingham	0.915	0.336	2.488	-0.174	0.862	11 / 989	6 / 494			_
Pre-exposure		0.926	0.408	2.104	-0.183	0.855					
Overall		0.939	0.756	1.165	-0.574	0.566					•
									0.01	0.1	1

Favours HCQ Favours Control

Low dose hydroxychloroquine is associated with lower mortality in COVID-19: a meta-analysis of 26 studies and 44,521 patients

				Risk Ratio	Risk Ratio
Study or Subgroup	log[Risk Ratio]	SE	Weight	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% Cl
1.1.1 NO RCT					
Albani F, 2020	-0.274	0.184	5.0%	0.76 [0.53, 1.09]	
Arshad S, 2020	-1.079	0.149	5.5%	0.34 [0.25, 0.46]	
Ayerbe L, 2020	-0.942	0.25	4.2%	0.39 [0.24, 0.64]	
Catteau L, 2020	-0.38	0.053	6.5%	0.68 [0.62, 0.76]	-
Di Castelnuovo A, 2020	-0.357	0.09	6.2%	0.70 [0.59, 0.83]	-
Geleris, 2020	0.039	0.121	5.8%	1.04 [0.82, 1.32]	+
lp A, 2020	-0.01	0.108	6.0%	0.99 [0.80, 1.22]	+
Kalligeros M, 2020	0.513	0.886	0.8%	1.67 [0.29, 9.48]	
Lagier JC, 2020	-0.416	0.774	1.0%	0.66 [0.14, 3.01]	
Lammers AJJ, 2020	-0.041	0.213	4.6%	0.96 [0.63, 1.46]	
Lauriola M, 2020	0.103	0.371	2.9%	1.11 [0.54, 2.29]	_
Lecronier M, 2020	-0.478	0.354	3.0%	0.62 [0.31, 1.24]	
Magagnoli J, 2020	0.604	0.233	4.4%	1.83 [1.16, 2.89]	
Mahevas M, 2020	0.182	0.538	1.8%	1.20 [0.42, 3.44]	
Membrillo FJ, 2020	-2.654	0.889	0.8%	0.07 [0.01, 0.40]	←
Mikami T, 2020	-0.635	0.129	5.7%	0.53 [0.41, 0.68]	-
Paccoud O, 2020	-0.117	0.692	1.2%	0.89 [0.23, 3.45]	
Rosenberg ES, 2020	0.077	0.275	3.9%	1.08 [0.63, 1.85]	_ + _
Sbidian E, 2020	0.049	0.13	5.7%	1.05 [0.81, 1.35]	+
Singh S, 2020	-0.051	0.13	5.7%	0.95 [0.74, 1.23]	-
Sulaiman T, 2020	-1.022	0.411	2.6%	0.36 [0.16, 0.81]	
Yu B, 2020	-1.02	0.357	3.0%	0.36 [0.18, 0.73]	
Subtotal (95% CI)			86.2%	0.75 [0.63, 0.89]	
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.1	0; Chi ² = 105.05, d	if = 21 (P < 0.000	I01); I² = 80%	
Test for overall effect: Z =	3.30 (P = 0.0010)				
1.1.2 RCT					
Cavalcanti AB 2020	0.385	0.572	1.6%	1 47 (0 48 4 51)	
Hongchao P. 2020	0.174	0.148	5.5%	1.19 [0.89, 1.59]	+
Horby P. 2020	0.086	0.063	6.4%	1.09 [0.96, 1.23]	
Skipper CP. 2020	0	1.422	0.3%	1.00 [0.06, 16,23]	
Subtotal (95% CI)	-		13.8%	1.11 [0.99, 1.24]	
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.0	0; Chi² = 0.55, df =	: 3 (P = I	0.91); I ^z =	0%	
Test for overall effect: Z =	1.77 (P = 0.08)		,,		
Total (95% CI)			100.0%	0.79 [0.67, 0.93]	•
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = 0.1	1; Chi ² = 142.63, d	if = 25 (P < 0.000	01); I ² = 82%	
Test for overall effect: Z =	2.77 (P = 0.006)				0.05 0.2 1 5 20
Test for subgroup differe	nces: Chi² = 13.93	, df = 1 ((P = 0.00)	02), I² = 92.8%	

Di Castelnuovo A, et al. med Rxiv 2020

Ivermectin: Acute Infections

Mortality

Group by	Study name		Statist	ics for e	ach study	<u>L</u>	Dead /	Total		Odd	Odds ratio and 9	Odds ratio and 95% Cl	Odds ratio and 95% Cl	Odds ratio and 95% Cl	Odds ratio and 95% Cl
RCT-Obs		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	lvermectin	Control							
OBS	Rajter	0.524	0.287	0.958	-2.099	0.036	26/173	27 / 107			│ │ -悪-	│ │ -靈-│ │			
OBS	Khan	0.121	0.015	0.969	-1.990	0.047	1/115	9/133	I —						
OBS	Gorial	0.842	0.039	18.393	-0.109	0.913	0/16	2/71							
OBS	Budhiraja	0.118	0.007	1.932	-1.499	0.134	0/34	103/942	<		k	<u> </u>	<u>← </u>	k <u>− </u>	
OBS		0.451	0.258	0.789	-2.793	0.005									
RCT	Mahmud	0.138	0.007	2.694	-1.306	0.192	0/183	3/180	<hr/>	<u> </u>	<u>← </u>	<u>← </u>	<u>← </u>		
RCT	Hashim	0.314	0.061	1.611	-1.389	0.165	2/70	6/70			│ ┼╼┼				
RCT	Elgazzar	0.074	0.017	0.318	-3.502	0.000	2/200	24 / 200	-	∎	│ — ■				
RCT	Niaee	0.154	0.047	0.506	-3.080	0.002	4 / 120	11/60		│ ─┼■─	│ ─┼┳── │			│ _┼╋── │ │ │	
RCT	Cadegiani	0.046	0.002	0.970	-1.980	0.048	0 / 585	2/137	<	k	k	<u>←</u>	<u>←</u>		
RCT		0.136	0.064	0.288	-5.207	0.000				-					
Overall		0.294	0.188	0.461	-5.347	0.000				◀					
									0.01	0.01 0.1	0.01 0.1 1	0.01 0.1 1 10	0.01 0.1 1 10	0.01 0.1 1 10 10	0.01 0.1 1 10 100

Favours Ivermectin Favours Control

Ivermectin: Acute Infections

Mortality

Group by	Study name		Statist	ics for e	ach study	L	Dead /	Total		
RCT-Obs		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	lvermectin	Control		
OBS	Rajter	0.524	0.287	0.958	-2.099	0.036	26/173	27 / 107		
OBS	Khan	0.121	0.015	0.969	-1.990	0.047	1/115	9/133	I —	
OBS	Gorial	0.842	0.039	18.393	-0.109	0.913	0 / 16	2/71		
OBS	Budhiraja	0.118	0.007	1.932	-1.499	0.134	0/34	103/942	<	
OBS		0.451	0.258	0.789	-2.793	0.005				
RCT	Mahmud	0.138	0.007	2.694	-1.306	0.192	0/183	3/180	<	
RCT	Hashim	0.314	0.061	1.611	-1.389	0.165	2/70	6/70		
RCT	Elgazzar	0.074	0.017	0.318	-3.502	0.000	2/200	24 / 200	—	
RCT	Niaee	0.154	0.047	0.506	-3.080	0.002	4 / 120	11/60		-
RCT	Cadegiani	0.046	0.002	0.970	-1.980	0.048	0 / 585	2/137	<	
RCT		0.136	0.064	0.288	-5.207	0.000				6
Overall		0.294	0.188	0.461	-5.347	0.000				
									0.01	0

Favours Ivermectin Favours Control

Ivermectin: Prophylaxis

Symptomatic infections

Group by	Study name		Statist	ics for e	ach study	<u> </u>	Symptomatic Inf	ection / Total		Odd	s ratio and 9	5% CI	
Туре		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-Ivermectin	Group-Control					
Obs	Behera	0.127	0.069	0.232	-6.704	0.000	15 / 91	171 / 281					
Obs	Carvallo- 2	0.000	0.000	0.007	-5.426	0.000	0 / 788	237 / 407	K				
Obs		0.099	0.055	0.178	-7.703	0.000				•			
RCT	Elgazzar	0.184	0.039	0.861	-2.150	0.032	2 / 100	10 / 100					
RCT	Shouman	0.057	0.029	0.110	-8.542	0.000	15 / 203	59 / 101	-	-∎-∤			
RCT	Carvallo -1	0.029	0.002	0.497	-2.441	0.015	0 / 131	11 / 98	<		-		
RCT		0.066	0.036	0.118	-9.019	0.000							
Overall		0.080	0.053	0.122	-11.822	0.000				-			
									0.01	0.1	1	10	

Favours Ivermectin Favours Control

Ivermectin: Prophylaxis

Symptomatic infections

roup by	Study name		Statisti	cs for e	ach study	<u> </u>	Symptomatic Inf	ection / Total	
Туре		Odds ratio	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	Group-Ivermectin	Group-Control	
Post-exposure	Elgazzar	0.184	0.039	0.861	-2.150	0.032	2 / 100	10 / 100	
Post-exposure	Shouman	0.057	0.029	0.110	-8.542	0.000	15 / 203	59 / 101	
Post-exposure		0.068	0.037	0.125	-8.701	0.000			
Pre-exposure	Behera	0.127	0.069	0.232	-6.704	0.000	15 / 91	171 / 281	
Pre-exposure	Carvallo -1	0.029	0.002	0.497	-2.441	0.015	0 / 131	11 / 98	
Pre-exposure	Carvalllo-2	0.000	0.000	0.007	-5.426	0.000	0 / 788	237 / 407	
Pre-exposure		0.094	0.053	0.167	-8.038	0.000			
Overall		0.080	0.053	0.122	-11.822	0.000			

Favours Ivermectin Favours Control

Failed and Successful Rx for COVID-19 by Phase of Illness

	Pre-exposure/ Post-Exposure/ Incubation	Symptomatic Phase	Pulmonary/ inflammatory phase
Hydroxychloroquine	Unclear benefit	No benefit	?Trend to harm
Remdesivir	n/a	?? Reduced time to recovery No mortality benefit	No benefit
Lopivinar-Ritonavir	n/a	No benefit	No benefit
Interferon α/ β	Inhaled ? Benefit	No benefit	?Trend harm
Tocilizumab	n/a	n/a	No Benefit
Convalescent Serum	n/a	Unlikely	No Benefit
Corticosteroids	n/a	Trend to harm	BENEFIT
Ivermectin	BENEFIT	BENEFIT	BENEFIT

Time Course and approach to Rx



